

Reviewer's report

Title: Breast cancer therapy for BRCA1 carriers: moving towards platinum standard?

Version: 1 **Date:** 17 February 2009

Reviewer: Franco Muggia

Reviewer's report:

This Editorial comment by Imyanitov addresses a very timely issue in the treatment of breast cancers that arise in BRCA mutation carriers. There are robust data from animal models suggesting that cancers arising in this background are most sensitive to platinum drugs. Clinical trials have lagged in determining the role of such compounds, and the author makes an impassioned plea for imaginative designs to address such urgent therapeutic questions in a timely manner, and provides a recent example in a small series published by Byrski et al. The argument is quite compelling, and it could be strengthened by adding a sentence on the nature of this small trial (a Polish Oncology network, in collaboration with Dr. Steven Narod).

Putting together even a small series of recently diagnosed breast cancer in mutation carriers presupposes an organizational structure that allows this to happen (genetic testing, and consenting in a clinical trial) in a timely manner. The presentation is clear in presenting the point of view of the need to accelerate progress in this area, and in providing the strong rationale for the integration of platinum compounds. It also makes reference to the possibility that taxanes may not be as helpful in this setting. Both aspects would be strengthened by providing details on how these clinical trials were coordinated.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests